

# PLANNING APPLICATION NUMBER: P05/2643

Type of approval sought	Tree Preservation Order
Ward	
Applicant	Dudley Zoological Gardens
Location:	<b>DUDLEY ZOOLOGICAL GARDENS, 2, THE BROADWAY, DUDLEY, WEST MIDLANDS, DY1 4QB</b>
Proposal	<b>FELLING OF 9 NO ASH TREES AND CROWN LIFT - 3 NO SYCAMORE TREES</b>
Recommendation Summary:	<b>APPROVE SUBJECT TO CONDITIONS</b>

**TREE PRESERVATION ORDER NO: D 12(1970) – T479, T516, T342, T340, T338 & T336**

## SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

1. The trees subject to this application are 3 over mature Ash trees; 3 Mature Sycamore trees, and 5 young ash trees. The trees are all situated around the newly proposed lion enclosure. As the trees are all situated adjacent to foot paths in the zoo they are all highly visible and provide at least moderate amenity to the area

## PROPOSAL

2. Summary of proposals for the works on the protected trees is as follows:
  - Felling of nine Ash trees and the crown lifting of 3 Sycamore trees.
3. The trees are marked on the attached plan.

## HISTORY

4. There have been 3 previous Tree Preservation Order applications on the site.

<i>Site History</i>		
Application No	P00/51704	12/10/00
Proposal	Maintenance work to various trees.	Approved with conditions.
Application No	P00/51703	27/11/00
Proposal	Fell 2 ash trees	Approved with conditions
Application No	83/50454	10/03/83

Proposal	Felling of one Ash Tree	Approved
----------	-------------------------	----------

## PUBLIC CONSULTATION

5. No public representations have been received.

## ASSESSMENT

### Tree(s) Appraisal

Criteria	Tree 1	Tree 2	Tree 3	Tree 4
Species	Ash	Ash	Ash	Ash
Height	18m	18m	18m	8m
Spread	12m	10m	14m	4m
Diameter	900mm	800mm	900mm	200mm
Form	Poor	Poor	Moderate	Poor
Vigour	Poor	Poor	Poor	Good
Approx Age	Over Mature	Over Mature	Over Mature	Young
Pests / Diseases	Inonotus hispidus and Honey Fungus identified.	Inonotus hispidus on major scaffold limbs	Ganoderma and Inonotus hispidus present on limbs.	None evident
Canopy	Poor.	Poor	Poor	Poor
% Deadwood	10% in tree, large amounts on ground.	10%	10%	1%
Cavities	At Old pruning wounds, a number are substantially decayed.	Significant cavities at old pruning wounds on main scaffold limbs.	At Main fork, and old pruning wounds.	None Evident
Bark	Moderate	Good	Good	Good
Roots	Evidence of Honey Fungus, suggests that root structure may be compromised.	Slight decay evident in buttress hollows.	Moderate – on edge of bank	Good
Overall Health	Poor	Poor	Poor	Good
Visibility	High	High	High	High
Amenity Value	High	High	High	Moderate

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Tree 5</b>	<b>Tree 6</b>	<b>Tree 7</b>	<b>Tree 8</b>
Species	Ash	Ash	Ash	Ash
Height	8m	8m	8m	8m
Spread	4m	4m	4m	4m
Diameter	200mm	200mm	200mm	200mm
Form	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
Vigour	Good	Good	Good	Good
Approx Age	Young	Young	Young	Young
Pests / Diseases	None evident	None evident	None evident	None evident
Canopy	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
% Deadwood	1%	1%	1%	1%
Cavities	None Evident	None Evident	None Evident	None Evident
Bark	Good	Good	Good	Good
Roots	Good	Good	Good	Good
Overall Health	Good	Good	Good	Good
Visibility	High	High	High	High
Amenity Value	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Tree 9</b>	<b>Tree 10</b>	<b>Tree 11</b>
Species	Sycamore	Sycamore	Sycamore
Height	14m	12m	16m
Spread	7m	8m	10m
Diameter	600mm	600mm	800mm
Form	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate
Vigour	Good	Moderate	Good
Approx Age	Mature	Mature	Mature
Pests / Diseases	None evident	None evident	None evident
Canopy	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate
% Deadwood	3%	3%	3%
Cavities	None Evident	Slight cavities in scaffold limbs.	In some branches, not significant.
Bark	Good	Good	Good
Roots	Good	Good	Slight Grazing Damage
Overall Health	Good	Good	Moderate
Visibility	High	High	High
Amenity Value	Moderate	Moderate	High

Further Assessment

6. The trees subject to this application are three mature Sycamores, three mature Ash trees and five young ash trees. The trees are situated around an animal enclosure at Dudley Zoo. The trees are all visible from the public walkways around the animal enclosure, and provide a good amount of amenity to the visitors to the zoo.
7. Tree 1 – This is a large over mature Ash tree that is situated on the south western side of the animal enclosure. On inspection there were a number of fungal brackets that were observed on the major scaffold limbs.
8. The brackets were mainly centred on old pruning wounds. *Inonotus hispidus* is a common decay fungus and is often found on ash trees. The decay characteristics of this fungus are such that major limb failure can occur at an early stage of infection. Also on inspection of the hollows between the buttresses a patch of white mycelium was found where a patch of bark had been removed. This white mycelium is normally associated with the root damaging fungus of Honey Fungus (*Armillaria* sp.). Honey fungus causes the degradation of the main buttress roots just below the soil line. Ultimately the presence of the Honey Fungus is likely to lead to total failure of a tree. As such this tree's safety can no longer be guaranteed. Due to the public access around the tree it is recommended that the tree is felled on safety grounds.
9. Tree 2 – This is a large over mature ash tree situated on the south western side of the animal enclosure. Again the presence of *Inonotus hispidus* was observed around old pruning wounds on the major scaffold limbs. The resistograph drilling that was taken in this tree shows that there is an area of decay on the south side of this tree. Also on inspection further small pockets of decay were found in and around the buttress roots.
10. Whilst the decay in the main stem is not considered significant enough to warrant the felling of the tree on its own, the presence of the *Inonotus* in the main scaffold limbs dictates that the tree should be pollarded to its primary forks. This would leave a 6 metre stump with no branches, and due to the age and condition of the tree, it only has a limited chance of recovering from this shock. As such it is considered that the amenity of the area would be better served by the removal of the tree and its replacement with an appropriate species.
11. Tree 3 – This is an Ash tree, situated on the edge of a wooded area on the north western side of the animal enclosure. Again this tree is large; over mature and has had little management during its life time. Again there is evidence of *Inonotus hispidus* on the old pruning wounds of the main scaffold limbs, and there is also a *Ganoderma* bracket close to the primary fork. As the eastern side of the tree overhangs a public footway through the zoo, it is imperative that the decayed limbs of this tree are removed. The removal of the limbs that overhang the public footway would leave the tree unbalanced and liable to failure due to the weight imbalance. Again it is recommended that removal and replacement of this tree would be most appropriate.
12. Trees 4 – 8 – These Ash trees are situated on the northern side of the animal enclosure. They are part of a line of ten young trees that have grown to form a solid

screen. Due to the proximity of these trees to each other, they are now suppressing each other and a thinning out of the group is required to allow the healthy development of the remaining trees. The works will not detrimentally affect the amenity of the area as there will still be 5 trees remaining to form that screen, which in time will grown to fill in the gaps left by the removed trees.

13. Trees 9, 10 & 11 – These are three sycamore trees that are situated around animal enclosure. The application proposes a crown lift to six metres. This is requested to allow the erection of a new safety fence for the proposed lion enclosure. On inspection of the trees they were found that the trees were all in a good state of health with no significant defects. Also the proposed 6 metre crown lift would not detrimentally affect the health of the amenity of the trees as they are mature enough to withstand the pruning.

## CONCLUSION

14. The trees subject to this application are three mature Ash trees, three mature Sycamore trees and five young ash trees. The trees are all located close to the public areas of the zoo and therefore provide a good amount of amenity to the visitors of the zoo.
15. The three mature ash trees were all found to be in a poor state of health, with evidence of *Inonotus hispidus* infections present on all three. Honey fungus was identified on Tree 1 and *Ganoderma* was identified on Tree 3. This combined with the general poor condition of the trees suggest that the tree should be removed on safety grounds, as they are located in areas with high pedestrian traffic. Whilst their removal will have a detrimental affect on the amenity of the area, replacements should be secured to go some way to mitigate this.
16. The three sycamore trees that are proposed to be crown lifted to six metres are all located close to the edge of the animal enclosure. The crown lift to six metres will not have a detrimental affect on the amenity that the tree provides or the health and safety of the tree as such it should be approved.
17. The five young ash trees that are to be removed from the line of ten on the northern side of the animal enclosure, are all in a good state of health, however due to the proximity of the other trees in the line are becoming suppressed. As such the thinning out of this line is required to ensure the healthy development of the remaining trees. This will not have a detrimental affect on the amenity of the area as the surrounding trees will soon infill the gaps left by the trees that have been removed.

## RECOMMENDATION

18. It is recommended that application is approved subject to the conditions set out below.

Conditions and/or reasons:

1. The tree works subject of this consent shall be carried out in accordance with British Standard BS 3998:1989 'Recommendations for Treework'.
2. The tree is to be inspected for bird nests and any crevices for bats. If any nests are present and disturbance to nesting or fledgling birds are present then works shall not be undertaken between 1st March and 30th August in any year. If bats are present then advice should be sought from English Nature or the local Wildlife Trust.
3. Five replacement trees shall be planted between the beginning of November and the end of March, within 1 year of felling (and replanted if necessary) and maintained until satisfactorily established. The size, species and location of the replacement trees shall be agreed in writing with the Local Planning authority prior to the felling of the tree to which this application relates.